請容許我以龍應台的文字作結:「我(龍應台)所目睹的21世紀初的香港,已經脫離殖民七年了,政府是一個香港人的政府,但是我發現,政府機器的運作思維,仍舊是殖民時代的思維。殖民思維有幾個特點:它一不重視本土文化和歷史,二不重視草根人民,三不重視永續發展。...「脫離殖民」意味著,把殖民者所灌輸的美學品味、價值偏重和歷史觀點——不見得推翻,但是徹底重新反省,開始以自己的眼光瞭解自己,開始用自己的詞彙定義自己。...我沒看到這個過程真正在香港發生。」

參考資料:

Central Government Offices Historic and Architectural Appraisal

政府山關注組

Gwulo: Old Hong Kong

Berlin Underworlds Association

龍應台. <香港, 你往那裏去?> 《龍應台的香港筆記@沙灣徑25號》. 天地圖書. 2006年

退休建築師李鉞的文章

信報財經新聞 2011-03-05 P13 讀者之聲 By 李鉞

政府應還地於民

2006年中,立法會動用了當時盈餘的一半(52億)和四公頃的貴重地皮興建政府總部,以「一棵樹」和「保育山」六個虛無的字,兌換了當時民主黨的九票。當時筆者已說:「一字值一個半票(則每字8.66億元),民主黨們,你們認為政府肯信守上述六個字,而「政府山」不作地產項目?歷史很快就會告訴你們」。

「政府山」不是新創作

五年後的今天,在發展局局長林鄭月娥還在說延長政府西翼建 32 層的甲級寫字樓和五層地底商場的諮詢期時,財政司長曾俊華已在 2011-12 的財政預算報告的 35 段,爲政府西翼的甲級寫字樓和淘空半個政府山鳴鑼開道。

事實上,在添馬艦政府總部還未動工前,「政府山」的棋盤推手早已展開。

回歸前的建築署已有政府山重建政府合署的初步方案。繼後亦有用「公私合營」發展模式的建築模型,放在輔政司署的辦公室。政府山的地段合倂棋局,早已開始。

這次政府先以綜合發展區的形式,先吃邊陲的西翼,進而或以保育形式,吃掉終審法院(即前法國傳道會大樓),最後的東中兩翼,自是以「哪能暴殄天物」的形式全部吃掉。這樣一個與愛丁堡及皇后廣場、大會堂及和平紀念碑,同具歷史與城市規劃價值的「政府山」,就此灰飛煙滅。

前地政總署署長劉勵超可能忙於土地供應,出入多年政府合署而少讀香港歷史,認爲「政府山」是保育者的虛構名稱。無論是早至 1840 年代的舊文獻或是近代文獻,一直都用「政府山」這名稱,劉勵超對於他認爲「政府山」是保育者的純粹創作,令人感到相當詫異。筆者建議他多到圖書館,翻閱文獻,或多與退休或現任的同僚溝通,以擴闊視野。劉先生身爲土地的總供應者,而如此昧於「地情」,真是可惜!

西九環在曬太陽

筆者最近到上海一遊,深深體會到上海既在建築飛躍進步的同時,亦能平衡保育和活化古建築物(不是單以年代計算,而是以每個城市歷史的章節的代表作爲評選)。站在那已完成的黃浦江畔外攤大道雙層地下交通與管道層上的江畔行人步行區,遠看,外攤那百多年的建築群帶與對岸陸家嘴的新型建築群,回看我們政府的施政思維,怎不唏嘘?還有的是外攤古建築群後的「洛克外攤」,地盤已全面封板;我們的西九文化區,還在繼續曬太陽。

紫檀樹不倒,已是不爭事實。如何活化「保育山」,須注入新的公民社會的生命力,這包括保育者、專業團體、有良心的退休公務員與政黨等。在現今瀰漫悲情的香港社會中,政府何不放下身段,利用此機會還地於民,排解目下高漲的官民對立,營造民間與政府的良性互動契機,共建「環珠灣區」內「一國兩制」的宜居城市呢?

公共專業聯盟委員李鉞

信報財經新聞 2011-01-08 P12 時事評論 By 李鉞

從「典當」政府山看施政水平

政府以「保育中環」割裂半個政府山,興建一座與渣打銀行大廈及滙豐銀行大廈高度相若的甲級寫字樓,內有五層商場,淘空了整個政府合署西翼的土地。這個構思,是否就是 2006 年與民主黨交換條件的所謂「保育山」的神髓呢?

以一個三十後的老人來看,「政府山」與政府合署有說不完的集體回憶。回顧二次大戰後,英國人重建政府合署,那時西翼的工地,都是單幢的木建兵房,與澳洲維多利亞省的 Timber Top(英王儲查理斯早年寄宿的學校)的簡樸、刻苦和拓荒式的工作生活方式相若。那時的建築師、工程師,包括土木、結構、機電和港口工程師等,都喜歡穿白短袖恤衫,白短褲和白長襪的Safari 裝,令人有樸素親民的氣息。

用料布局實而不華

政府合署建築物的外形、用料和布局,實而不華,盡顯當時實用主義的建築風格,在當時戰後的英聯邦建築界內評價極高;但更深層次的是政府山上洋溢的管治精神。試想想,香港從一個蕞爾小島蛻變成東方之珠、亞洲四小龍,多年來列爲最自由和最具競爭力的世界級城市,在許多國際性的經濟和金融領域上,都能以獨特的非主權國家佔一席位;在國際貨幣上,港元亦能自由兌換。這都是「政府山」蘊藏的 intangible(不可捉摸)的管治思維的源泉,亦爲當年引以爲榮的一流政務主任團隊搖籃。

這次政府以 Public Miller Triton LLP 報告「典當」半個政府山,爲建造一座與政府山絕不協調的甲級寫字樓和多層商場鳴鑼開路。其實 Michael Morrison 的立論十分清晰,就是政府山上的政府合署三翼,與禮賓府及聖約翰大教堂等建築群布局合理,建築外形與設計風格等,亦具優雅和實用建築主義的精粹,保持其歷史傳統價值,以不動爲「上策」。如要改動,則西翼因歷史價值與建築元素較東中翼弱【註 1】,可作改動,是爲「中策」。假如真要改動西翼,則重建的西翼,必須在整體上應保持現有建築物的範圍和高度(只有西翼的西端,才可考慮興建「較高」樓層的建築物),是爲「下策」。

斷章取義採用「下策」

這次政府斷章取義,在既非缺水缺糧的經濟環境下採用「下策」。以筆者意見,空置後的西翼,應以「3R」的持續發展的建築思維(則 Renew, refresh 和 reinvigorate)和讓非牟利的團體進駐,如平機會、消費者委員會,或半官方式的申訴專員和私隱專員等。這樣既可提升西翼的外貌與內涵,令它再振翅高飛。

專家建議的西翼未端(則因街影日照條例而傾斜的建築部分),可另行設計爲一具彫塑性的建築

通道,帶上政府合署三翼的平台花園,打造爲一市民共用的花園公共空間。現成的西翼餐廳層,則可與這花園公共空間連結一起,爲中區的上班族提供一個大眾化的午膳地方。這樣既「保」且「育」的政府山,既可東往香港公園,南往禮賓府與植物公園,西沿下亞畢諾道,與藝穗會、雲咸街的畫廊,中區警署的古蹟文物保育,未來中環街市的城市綠洲,再加上兩條北斜路的蘭桂坊和蘇豪的餐飲帶,這才是「保育中環」應具的神髓。

近來政府施政,流行即興式的見步行步,缺乏整體性與連貫性。民主黨的「一棵樹」和「保育山」兌換九票建添馬艦總部的賬是要兌現的【註2】。擔心的是,現在曾班子已陷入看守政府的「Anything he touch,it breaks」的艱辛時期(西九的大天幕與中區警署的大竹棚),如果再利用「保育中環」四字只諮詢中西區區議會,或利用城規會繞過立法會推動這個「下策」,則更是愚昧。看來一個更長的與民並商「保育中環」的諮詢期,捕捉全港市民對政府山的感情價值與倦戀,是必須的。

註 1: 其實這正是英國人層次格局分明的聰明。因中翼除了行政立法會議廳外,就是輔政司署和 財政司署的辦公廳,東翼則是律政司署和工務局,西翼則爲與市民交接多的部門,既方便接待市 民,亦可保持東中翼的寧靜。建築物的外形與用料層次,也正正反影了上述功能的層次。

註 2: 「一棵樹」是中翼前的百年紫檀,應全無問題。但「保育山」如何「保」和如何「育」,正是全港市民都要深入諮詢。作者爲退休建築師李鉞

明報 2011-02-17 A29| 觀點| 來函| By 李鉞

政府山保育

作爲貴報差不多半個世紀的讀者,對貴報 2011 年 2 月 7 日的社評〈政府應排除萬難,解決甲級商廈不足〉的立論,十分詫異與驚奇。社評的標題是對的,但未段的「政府總部西座保育價值不高,保育者應讓路」,那就大錯特錯了。難道貴報的社評,就像數月前謝偉俊在立法會上,建議把那還未平頂的添馬艦總部,放回作甲級商廈,以解不足,同樣搞笑?事實上,謝議員已隨後解釋,這純是立會辯論時的助語詞和增加效果的例子而已。

淘空半個政府山去增加甲級寫字樓,面積不過 2.8 萬平方米,與 IFC 的樓面面積,十分一也不到,杯水車薪,但其負面影響,如歷史傳承,城市發展的章節的被撕裂,整個百多年的政教合一的完整規劃的被破壞,怎不會令全世界講求人文教育(而非拘泥於 \$ 的市儈金融追逐者)的恥笑!或者簡易一點,從城市規劃來說,中環那狹窄的汽車及行人通道,已是超重,中環的空氣污染指數,日日都是過高,難道全本地化的政府官員,還是視而不見,聽而不聞呢?

早於 2005 年,政府與民間在添馬艦爭取用地時,筆者已力主釋放市區軍事用地和在西九趕建像倫敦 Canary Wharf 的第二金融中心,還有的是在現在中環金融中心的東傍,灣仔北的政府大樓、稅務大樓及入境事務大樓,如有決心,是很快可以改裝和包裝成爲甲級私人寫字樓,成爲另一嶄新的金融中心。

最近筆者在帶領年輕人作政府山漫遊時,偶遇唐司長於炮台徑,筆者戲言在西翼的末端,只准加建較高樓層,作爲金管局的總部。騰空的 IFC 金管局甲級寫字樓,既可挹注市場需求,亦可增庫房收入,更加可発陳德霖遠眺海景時,只是一片白濛(任志剛的海景評語)。唐司長亦微笑回應。假如成事,這就是真正的共建和諧社會。

以上胡言亂語,亦是建基於筆者對貴報數十年的擁護。政府山的 encounter 已由公開諮詢的層面上進入誠信、正直的正反辯論敏感階段。任何曲解⁄操縱保育者、民間、古蹟文物建築師與專業團體的獨立言論,都是不智的。

Government Hill History – Government Brief: Annex B

by Hong Kong Government

Quotation Ref.: AMO0901004

A Brief Historical Account of Central Government Offices, Central HKSAR

Situated at Lower Albert Road, the existing Central Government Offices (CGO) cover an area stretching from Garden Road westwards to include the site of the original Secretariat Building. CGO have a history of some 50 years. Flanking the St. John's Cathedral compound and dominating the frontage of Garden Road that is a main artery for traffic up the Victoria Peak, they form a familiar Central District landmark for half of a century. Photographs of the main buildings within the CGO are attached.

- 2. Apart from the government buildings, the Murray Battery (named after Sir George Murray, Master General of the Ordnance from 1841 to 1846) was established on the site of the existing West Wing car park in 1854 and remained on the site until about 1895. Battery Path is now the only reminder of this early battery.
- 3. Shortly after the Second World War, the construction of CGO was considered to be long overdue, for the then existing accommodation was inadequate and many government departments were scattered inconveniently in rented accommodation throughout the city. In July 1952, after delays due to the late arrival of materials and plant, construction works commenced in three sections.

Government XIII

- 4. The existing CGO stands on an area known as the "Government Hill," bounded by upper section of Upper Albert Road on the south, Queen's Road Central north, Garden Road east, and Glenealy west of Hong Kong Island. The Government Hill was selected quite early on by the British as a site for a government office. Since the early years of colonial rule, the Government Hill was also carmarked for a church (St. John's Cathedral), the Government House and all major public offices, thus combining the functions of the Governor's residence and office, and offices for other government departments.
- 5. Another integral component of CGO was the now defunct Beaconsfield House (Kung Pak Hong [H.]Eff., or "Defend the North House", was the Cantonese name for Beaconsfield House). Beaconsfield House had been used as a clubhouse-cum-office of the Hong Kong Volunteer Defence Corps (HKVDC) and the headquarters of the Government Information Services (GIS). In the 1990s, the Beaconsfield House (together with the adjacent old Hilton Hotel) was demolished for redevelopment of the present 60-storey Cheung Kong Center.

East Wing (completed in 1954)

6. The whole construction of CGO took about six years to complete. The first section (now known as the East Wing) was almost completed and ready for occupation at the end of 1953. At the end of the year, the Governor's Secretariat

Quotation Ref.: AMO0901004

moved from the classical portices of its old home (the original Secretariat Building) to temporary quarters in the first section of the new Government Offices.

7. The East Wing of CGO provided an opportunity for reforms in the direction of working conditions and staff welfare that had long been contemplated. The whole of the East Wing building was air-conditioned, a consideration that increased efficiency to a like degree with comfort. In this new accommodation, the registries and general offices were more efficiently planned, lighter, and less congested. There were canteens, rest and recreation rooms for the staff.

Central Wing (completed in 1957)

- 8. The Central Wing of CGO now stands is the original site of the Secretariat Building built in 1847. The old Secretariat Building was pulled down in 1954 to make way for the Central Wing. During site excavation, a bronze circular plaque that commemorates the laying of the old Secretariat Building's foundation stone was found. The inscription records that the foundation stone of the old building was laid by the then Hong Kong Governor, Sir John Francis Davis, on 24 February 1847.
- 9. On 9 January 1957, the Central Wing was declared open by the then Hong Kong Governor, Sir Alexander Grantham. That day, the Governor unveiled a commemorative plaque affixed on the left hand side at the entrance lobby of the Central Wing, in the presence of members of both Executive and Legislative Councils. In his speech, the Governor described the then newly constructed CGO as "very fine-looking."

West Wing (completed in 1959)

10. Construction work of the final section of CGO (the present West Wing) started in 1957 and was completed in 1959. The West Wing was built on a very steeply sloping site and has six floors at one end and thirteen floors at the other. An underground car park was provided for approximately 140 cars.

Harrie Value

- 11. CGO has been the office of the central government associated with important historical events and leading figures of Hong Kong. It has been the site where members of the public aired their opinions on government policies and public affairs. It is also the place where most major policies were deliberated by government officers and unofficial members under the leadership of the Governor, now Chief Executive.
- 12. All along the Executive Council (ExCo) meetings are held, normally once a week, in CGO. The Legislative Council (LegCo) was once housed there until it was moved to the Old Supreme Court Building in 1985. CGO was the place where the Governor delivered the policy address, where the Financial Secretary announced the budget, and where the unofficial members participated in the formulation of government policies and the passing of ordinances.

Quotation Ref.: AMO0901004

Annox

13. As the seat of central government and with its long history since the opening of Hong Kong, the site should be regarded as having significant historical values. The site witnessed the historical development of Hong Kong Government from the colonial era to the present after the handover of sovereignty in 1997. The birth of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's Republic of China on 1 July 1997 marked the beginning of a new phase in the development of CGO.